

PENNSYLVANIA ORNITHOLOGICAL RECORDS COMMITTEE
210 Welcome Ave. Norwood, PA 19074

5 February 2002

David Hawk
521 Walnut St.
Lehighton, PA 18235

Dear Dave,

Thank you for submitting documentation on the Black-headed Gull at Beltzville State Park on 29 May 1999. After careful review, the Committee regrets that it has voted not to accept the record.

Members' opinions were split, and so the balloting went two rounds (which partly explains our delay in announcing the decision). The final vote was unanimous against acceptance, with most of the members believing that it was probably a Black-headed Gull but not without a reasonable doubt.

Different members expressed a variety of concerns: that the crucial details of the underwings' appearance were not given, that a size "larger than Bonaparte's" would apply to many gulls, that a "large" bill does not seem to characterize what a Black-headed bill would usually be considered to have, and that the description in general did not enable us to accept this species with complete certainty.

We emphasize that non-acceptance does not imply that the gull was not a Black-headed, but rather that the Committee felt the documentation did not support the identification conclusively.

We hope that this will not discourage you from documenting any rarities you may find in the future.

Sincerely,



For the Committee:
Paul Hess, Chairman

Record No. 340-02-1999

RARE BIRD REPORT

Species: Black Headed Gull Date of this Observation: 5/29/99

Date Found: _____ Last Date Seen: _____

Location: Beltzville State Park - Breast of Dam (Dam Side)Township/City: Franklin Twp County: CarbonPerson Writing this report: David HawkAddress: 521 Walnut StLehighton Pa Phone: 610-377-2407Other Observers: Bob FrantzWho found the bird first: We were together, Dave Hawk saw it first

Other documentation Included: (Circle all appropriate items)(Make sure all attached items are fully labeled)

Photograph

Audio Recording

Video Recording

If a Specimen, where is it stored? _____

Description: (Attach additional pages as needed—Please do not write on back of this form)

Bird past by Bob Frantz & Dave Hawk going towards the breast of the dam. We immediately knew this was an unusual gull. Luck was with us, and it came back passing within 20 yards of us. Field notes included: larger than Bonapartes, orange large bill, speckled brown head, trailing wing band, black band on white tail. We were not certain of what the bird was, but went to my house and used PJ Grant's book on Gulls and we were both in agreement that we saw a Black-head Gull (Larus ridibundus). It was a first winter molting to a first summer.

Page 195 Plate 10

Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee

Voting Ballot - Round One

Species: Black-headed Gull (*Larus ridibundus*)

Date of Sighting: 29 May 1999 to 29 May 1999

Location: CARBON

County: BELZTVILLE STATE PARK

Observer(s): David Hawk, Bob Frantz

Date of Submission: 1999

Submitted by: David Hawk

Written Description: Yes

Photo: No

Specimen: No

Recording: No

Member	Class I	Class II	Class III	Class IV-A				Abstain
					Class IV-B	Class IV-C	Class V	
G. Armistead				X				
D. Couchman			X					
P. Hess			X					
R. Ickes			X					
B. Reid			X					
P. Rodewald					X			
M. Sharp				X				
TOTALS			4	2	1			
DECISION								

Comments: 4/3/0

2ND Round

Signature (Secretary):



Date: 11/2/00

Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee

Tabulation Form - Round Two

Species: Black-headed Gull (*Larus ridibundus*)

Date of Sighting: 29 May 1999 to 29 May 1999

Location: BELTZVILLE STATE PARK

County: CARBON

Observer(s): David Hawk, Bob Frantz

Date of Submission: 1999

Submitted by: David Hawk

Written Description: Yes

Photo: No

Specimen: No

Recording: No

Member	Class I	Class II	Class III	Class IV-A				Abstain
					Class IV-B	Class IV-C	Class V	
G. Armistead				X				
D. Couchman				X				
P. Hess				X				
R. Ickes				X				
B. Reid				X				
P. Rodewald					X			
M. Sharp					X			
TOTALS				5	2			
DECISION								

Comments: 0/7

Signature (Secretary):

Date: